Earthquake Camps – OCHA – NGOs Staff Focus Group

January 2016, commissioned by United National OCHA camp cluster interested in the impact of rental subsidies and different assistance packages for people moved from the camps and back into residential housing. The focus groups were conducted with the Staff of programs implemented by Goal, Helpage, Concern, IOM, and Care.

Below is the English translation for one focus group with NGO staff working in camps conducted in January 2016. For those interested in more information, in the Oral History transcripts section there are a total of 10 transcribed focus groups with camp beneficiaries of different NGO programs.

Participants

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern

Socio Dig staff presentation.

Dr. Timothy Schwartz: My name is Tim. I am an anthropologist. I have been working in the country for over 25 years. I worked in the Dominican Republic for a time then I came back to Haiti. We are a team of 30 people in Socio Dig. We have 2 other foreigners in the team, an

American and French guy. Almathe and Stephanie are part of the team. I am going to let them introduce themselves.

StephaniePierre: My name is Stephenie Pierre. I think Dr. Schwartz already said everything. I am member in the Socio Dig staff. It is a pleasure to be here today with you to exchange information that we need to go farther with the survey.

Almathe Jean: Good morning. My name is Almathe. I am member of Socio Dig. We have sat with many beneficiaries and agents from the Relocation project and have gathered a lot of information from them on how the project works.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Good afternoon* everyone. My name is Joel Normil. I am an ex employee of Concern. I am happy for the invitation to attend this Focus Group.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: My name is Plaismond Nikenncia. I work for Help Age as an officer of relocation.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: My name is Cherubin Jocelito. I am working for Help Age as an officer of relocation

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: I am Charles Dalin. I work for Goal. I used to work in the relocation project but we don't have this project anymore. It's a pleasure to be here with you all.

I have seen you before?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: *Yes, at Concern office.*

Public: *LaughingJJJ*

I remember your face. I don't remember if it was at the Goal office, I worked for Goal before in Gressier.

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: *Did you meet Hertha?*

Emmm!

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: *She works in Gressier. Zorie was also there too.*

Yes, Zorie was also there. Also Hilaire and Bethony were ther too.

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: Bethony? Ok.

We worked on corn and beans production during the drought season.

We all know that each organization has their own strategies working on each project. We have an idea how each project works throught the beneficiaries and also from the report. Can each of you explain your role in the relocation project and the strategies you use when working in the camps to move people from the camps. Let's start with you, Joel.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Well, I worked as an agent. I first started working in camp Lapaix in Delmas 2. We worked in several communities in the metropolitan area. I worked in 3 different projects for Concern. We sat down with the beneficiaries first to explain to them what the project is about. We told them who will benefit form the project and what each person will receive.

What did each person receive?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: They each receive 20,000 gourdes as a rent subsidy. Then we will visit them a second time. After the second visit they will receive another installment. When we visit them second time if we don't find them in the house we rented for them they will not receive the next installment.

Did you give them any training?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Yes. We trained them on GDR. We gave the training on Livelihood. We trained on how to do business, especially those who do business downtown. We gave them a lot of trainings.

What is GDR?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *GDR is gestion, risk, and disaster.*

How long does that training last?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Well, its runs through a period of time. It can be 1 week or 2 weeks of training.

Tell us about Livelihood and how it works.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: I was not very involved in Livelihood. I am going leave that for Manette. I am an agent of GDR. Concern assigned agents to give the beneficiaries all the criteria of where to rent houses. They can't rent houses that are damaged. There rules that need to be followed.

Do they choose the house they want to live in?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *The beneficiaries choose the houses. Then they call us to go to verify the house they pick. After verifying the house we sign a contract with the owner. If the house doesn't respect all the criterias we will not pay for it.*

What are the other criteria beside the house being demaged in some way?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *The house shouldn't be damaged. It should not be located near a ravine. It needs to have a toilet or a latrine. The latrine needs to have a door. These are the criteria that need to be followed.*

Ok. Your name is Joel.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Ok. Help Age is an oganization that works with elderly people. That means we have a specific group of people we work with. We work in camps but at the beginning we did have some problem. How do we intervene? When we first started we didn't work with only elderly people in the relocation project.

We work with other organisations such as Concern, IOM, Goal, and organisations as partners. How is that done? As soon as we have all the information on the camp our partners will take all the young people who are eligible to relocate. We will take all the elderly ones. We took elders from 50 and up. Now we only take 60 and up.

How our project works? IOM will send a list with everyone who are eligible for the project then we will select the elderly from the list. Before it was stricter, a person could be 50 years old and might not be selected. After being evaluated we might find all the criteria why the person should not be selected for the project; if the person doesn't have dependents. That's how it used to be.

If he does't have what?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Dependent, such as kids. One of the aids we gave was in education. Now the project is different. Not all the elderly at first really needed our help. Now we take people who are really in need. We had to remove people from project because of that one criteria. Now we take both elderly with or without dependents. Because of that we are taking more people now. I will give you some of our criteria and I will let my collegue speak.

(LaughingJJJ)

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Gason; 31 ane; Sosyoloji; 4 ane ap travay ak Help Age *You can speak. I can add anything you miss.*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Ok. We do an evaluation to find the people who are eligible. Why do we do an evaluation? The date we have said everyone in the list is 60 or more. But when they present their IDs, some of them might 20, 30, or 40 years old (Laughing) Those are types of errors we sometimes find. Now after the evaluation we will help these people fill up proper documents such as chronic diseases, if he has dependents or not.

We will do what is called a baseline with these people. A baseline is a history of their lives. How are they living. How many children they have. What do they have to feed themselves? What they do for a living. What they were doing before the earthquake. It's like a history of their social lives. Where are they from. Where do they want go. It is after the baseline that we tell them what the project is about. We do a focus group with them like the one we are doing now.

We then tell what kind of house to select. We tell what they will get from Help Age. Now they can go look for houses. Like Joel said before, the house they pick should not have any type of damage. It should not be in on a hill or a steep slope because we don't want them to fall down. The house should not be too small. It needs to be a least 3 meters in size. It nees to have a latrine and the latrine should not be too far from the house. The house shoudn't have stairs because an elderly person will be living in it. At 60 someoone should not be climbing stairs. If the house has stairs they should not be too many. Those are the type of criteria we use for selecting houses. We also taught them their rights after 6 months living in the house and how to interact with the house owner.

Once he or she finds the house we have agents who will visit the house to verify it. If the house meets all our criteria we will then sign a contract with the owner. Now if the house does not meet our criteria, we tell them to look for another house. We also educate the house owner on why his house is not selected. The process will continue until we find a proper house to rent. It is after renting the house that we will do the next installment.

The problem is that we don't use cash. It would be risky if we were walking with the money on us while we go to the camps. Now when we do the payroll, we would call the house owners and pay them. Then we would give 800 gourdes to the beneficiary to carry his belongings from the camp to the new house.

Now as they leave the camp the second part of the project begins. In a month or less we will go and verify if he/she is still living in the house we rented. If yes, we then start with the second part of the project. They will get a package from us. We will pay health insurance for them for a year. We will pay school for 1 of their children, if they have children. We will give them money to buys some furniture. We will also give them money to start a small business. That is what we called AGR.

Ok. You pay rent for them for a year? You pay health insurance for a year and also school for the children?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Well, only if he has dependents. We only pay for 1 dependent.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Ok. What I want to add is on the education part. We don't pay school for the child. It is a program that helps the child in education. For example, if the child needs a book bag we can provide 1. We

don't pay school for the child. Maybe a school fee was not yet paid and we pay that fee. Maybe the child needs uniform and can provide the child with a uniform.

Ok

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: We gave them money to start a business and money to bay furniture.

You give them money for furniture and a business?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Also the training in GRD and AGR*.

Does everyone get the money to buy furniture?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Everyone got it. The difference is if the person does or doesn't have a dependent. A dependent would be someone who is in school not in university. Someone who is at least 23 years old and still depends on the beneficiary.

A dependent who can be no more than 23 years?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *That is still in school but not in university or maybe who is not in school at all.*

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Now there it is difffernt. Before the dependent could be 23 years old now he has to be more than 21 years old.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Before its was 23 now its 21 years.*

They lower the age?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Yes

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Yes

What about the health card, what does it cover?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Ok. The health care is with Dash. It covers all the basic health issuex. For example, blood test, glycemic test, vitamins, check their blood pressure, do a checkup if they are suffering from pain. We work in partnership with other NGOs, such as IOM. For example, we had someone who has a boil on his stomach but the insurance didn't cover that. We went to IOM to cover the surgery and anything else the health card doesn't cover

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Ok. To add to what my collegue Nekenncia said about the health card, it is just a health card that we have with Dash that covers the basic health needs of the beneficiaries. It covers the consultations fee. For instance, surgery, it doesn't cover that.*

That is why we do training on prevention for them. We told them that if they are in any kind of pain to go see a doctor and not to wait because that might lead to some type of surgery. We told them that the consultations and medications are free, although there are some medications that are not free. For example, a urine analysis is free but radiographs partially covered. The health card has a limit.

Ok. Who else in the household does it cover?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *No it only covers the beneficiary.*

Ok. You work with Dash?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Yes. We signed a contract with Dash. We gave each beneficiary a health card from Dash. The card is for one year. Practically, that's what they get.

Do they get access to a Dash clinic in their own area?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Ok. This is how the process works, first we get them in a group of about 25 to 30 elderly people. We have offices in Delmas and Tabarre where we hold the meetings. We invite Dash to participate in the meetings in order for them to properly explain what the insurance is about. Dash gives a card that has the location for every Dash clinic in the metropolitan area.*

Ok. They get training on AGR?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Before* we gave them AGR, we conduct training on small business management and savings. A day of training is from 8 AM to 3 PM. It is after the training we give them AGR.

Ok. They receive the trainning on small business management.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *In fact, we do the training before they receive the AGR.*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: We also gave training on GDR, gestions, risks, and disasters.

OK

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: We gave all that training in 1 day.

Ok. Does the trianing for AGR last 1 day, 1 week, or 3 months?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: We give all the training in 1 day.

Does everyone get another installement after the AGR training?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: They all might not get the money on the same day but within a week they will get a call to go to Unitransfer to get the money.

Ok. Ok. Does each beneficiary get the same amount?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Everyone gets the same thing. The only difference like I mentioned before it if the person has a dependent. If he has a dependent he will benefit from the education aid. If he doesn't he will not benefit from the aid for education.

The elders you help are they really at least 60 years?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: The package that Help Age provides is very different from what the other organizations provided. We get the elders from the other organisations as the most vulnerable. Our follow-ups with the elders are very intense. That is why we help in education and health, so that the money they get for AGR can last longer.

Before we give the AGR we do some kind of survey on the households to look for someone who can help the elders with the business. Sometimes it might happen that we select someone in the family to run the business because the beneficiary is too old to run a business.

Ok. I have a question for you. During our focus group some of the beneficiaries mentioned that they pay a fee for a badge. Can you give us a more explanation on that?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Ok. That is a confusion that is causing a problem. We make it very clear that Helpa Age is an international organization that works with elderly people. Before the earthquake Help Age wasn't working directly with people. It was working with local associations working with elderly people to reinforce their capabilties. Some of these associations are located in Delmas, Tabarre, and Cite Soiel. It is after the earthquake that Help Age is involved in the relocation project.

The reason that Help Age got involved in the relocation project is because we realized that old people were always the victims when it comes to getting aid. During food aid distributions elderly people were often the victim because they don't have the strength fight for food.

The question about the badges is because we know that the project is only for 1 year and we want the beneficiaries to be involved in local associations so when we no longer are there to help they always have some kind of moral support. Those associations are local. We have our trainings in their offices because we want them to be members in their local associations. There is a fee of 250 gourdes for a badge. We made it clear that it is not Help Age that is asking for that money. That fee is being asked by the local associations not by Help Age.

We know that these people are vulnerable. Is Help Age aware that they are asking to pay 250 gourdes for badges?

(Everyone is talking at the the same time.)

Public: Laughing JJJ

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: The problem is with members of the associations. Those are not strong associations. They always want to be identify as Help Age, which is not true. We are encouraging them to be autonomous. They lack the capacity to function on their own. During their first year Help Age paid half of their rent and on their third year Help Age stopped paying. That is why several of these associations don't have an office now.

Yes, they tried to identify themselves as Help Age but they are not Help Age.

Ok. Let me ask you another question.

Public :LaughingJJJ . Dalin, I haven't speak yet!

You have mentioned all the things to do in the project. To be honest with you it is the first time that I have heard an organization that has done so much. If you were in charge of the relocation project for Help Age what kind of changes would make? What would you do differently?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: To make the project better I would change the methods we use for AGR. The rental subsidy is only for 1 year. We give some help in education and in health; but is only to try to prevent our beneficiaries to spend less from the AGR.

Elders suffer from chronic illness such as tension, pain, and blood sugar. That is why they spend so much in hospitals. The health card helps them in spending less in hospitals so the business in can grow.

I think the project is not yet helping the most vulnerable. That is my observation. The project's objective has not yet been reached. Some beneficiaries spend the money as soon as they get it because one of their children needed something and they had to spend the AGR money. Even those who really open a business don't succeed.

There are things I would change. Instead of giving the whole AGR package at once I would give it in 2 installments. After they get the first installment I would follow up to check on their weakness and strength. After checking on them then I would give the second installment. I would rather see them lose half of the money instead of losing all.

I believe that would be better for the beneficiaries. We should sit down with them and ask them what type of business they want to do. You ask them how much they would need to start the business with. Doing that would make you as an officer more involve in the business.

Ok. You want to say something?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: What break my heart the most while working with these elders is that sometimes the money that is given to some of them is taken away. Sometimes they don't even get the chance to see the money that was given for them because someone else in the family took the money... We give two times more than the other organizations.

Public: Concern gives 12,000 gourdes, 11,000 gourdes, 12,000 gourdes, or 25,000 gourdes. I will give me details when I get the chance to talk.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Perfect!* The first thing I would do if I was in charge is that the elders without any form of ID I would do the follow up on them in person. Some of these elders doesn't even own a phone so they have no idea when Help Age give the money for them. I would tell these elders this the amount of money you got and ask them what they want to do with the money.

I think the money they receive for AGR to do business is a good thing. When you ask the what kind of business they want they might say they want to sell rice but when you give them the money to sell rice they do something else with the money. So the second change I would bring is buy the goods for them to sell instead of giving them the money to buy the goods themselves.

I would also not give the whole amount in one installment. Instead I would give the money in two installments in case something went wrong on buying the first stock of goods. These are some of the changes I would bring.

Ok. Now is your turn.

Public: *LauingingJJJ*

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: *Ok. My role in the project with Goal is to get in contact with the local authorities and the camps leaders to present the project. We tell the local authorities we will intervene in the camps in their*

communities and we need their support. As for the camps leaders we inform them that we are coming to the camps. On the same week that we make them aware we are coming we come to the camps with our team to register names of beneficiaries. We will compare the data we get with what we first got from IOM.

Sometimes we find names on our list that are not in the IOM list. We still register these names. We refer these people to UCLPP. UCLPP will find the ones that qualify for the aid and then we will add their names on the relocation project.

We refer the disabled to Handicap International and the elders to Help Age. We then present the the remaining beneficiaries. Like they already mentioned, we tell them in what condition the house should be in order for Goal to pay the rental fee. The rental fee is 20,000 gourdes.

They get another 1,000 gourdes to carry their belongings from the camp to the new house. Like Help Age we don't give the cash directly. They have to go to Sogexpress to get the money. They have 3 days to gather their belongings and leave the camp. Its almost the same as Help Age.

As soon as they leave the camps they we will start with the AGR training. They will get training on GDR, Wash, and also urban farming.

Does every beneficiary get the training?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: Not all beneficiaries got the urban farming training. In order to get that training you need to have land where you can farm. It doesn't have to be a lot of land. We send our technicians to evaluate the piece of land to verify if it is good for planting.

They need to be able to get water for the land but it doesn't have to be a lot of water. They would need water to water the garden. If they qualify after the evaluation then they get trained on urban farming. Goal will give the water hose and fertilizers. They will also learn how to get rid of insect to prevent them from destroying the garden.

What is WASH?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: It is a training on health. I don't remember everything they taught but I know they teach them how to wash

their hands and they will get a water filter. They will also get chlorox. The training is 2 months and week.

What is the filter?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: It is a bucket with a tube that will filter the water into drinking water.

How long will that bucket last?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: How long will the bucket last? They also get triainings on how to clean the tube. It won't last for long. As for AGR like Help Age they get the training over 8 weeks. Training is once a week. They will get 7,000 gourdes after the training.

Now they are getting 7,500 gourdes. Not everyone gets the 7,000 gourdes. They have to open a bank account with Fonkoze and we deposit the money in the account for them. They can leave maybe 100 gourdes on the account if they want but they can take the whole amount at once if they want to.

Has Goal been doing that since the begining?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: Yes. We did have a business plan for them to find out what they can invest their money in. It is after the 3rd training they will get the call for the money.

I don't quit understand.

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: It is after 8 differnt days of training they will receive the money to open the busness. You will not get the money if you only come to 2 days of training but after the 3 days of training, if you miss the rest of the training for some reason we will do some kind of catching with them on what they missed in ordered to get AGR.

Do they have to come to all 8 days of training?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: They don't have to but we don't tell them that. We always tell them the trainings are mandatory. They do come for training.

Do they get any transportion fee to come to the trianings?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: No. We dont give a transportion fee. We provide a meal for them during training. The triaining is not all day. The reason we don't give a transport fee is because where the training is being held is not far from where they live.

Is the same with Helap Age?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Well, that is one the methods that we forgot to apply. Some of our beneficiaries were coming from Carefour to Delmas for trainings. Once we were in Cite Soleil and we had to Delmas for security purpose. We didn't have the space near them and they had to come all the way to Delmas for trainings.

Did they get any transport fee?

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: We didn't have transportation fee in the package. We give them a meal during training for GDR. For AGR they get a snack in the morning and a meal in noon.

OK

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: With Concern, we tried to find a space near, them for instance a school. We trained them on how to do serums in case of emergencies. We do something that is called "Door to door". That is an emergency plan. We do that training with them in their own house. We took that training from Red Cross.

What is the emergency plan?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *It is a plan of prevention in case of emergency. What to do among themselves during emergencies. Where will they go if they need to leave the house? Write down the phone numbers that are important*

to contact. Write down the phone number and home address of places they can go during emergencies on a pamphlet.

Do you have an emergency plan for earthquakes?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Yes, we do. They know if there is an earthquake what to do. Even if the earth is shaking they need to leave the house. Scientifically what to do if they are inside the house.*

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *You want to talk?*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: I just want to add something. Yes! (laughing) I want to give an answer for Tim's question on the emergency plan. Here is what we do in the GRD training. We tell them how to act during all natural disasters. We do that training in their own houses because it involves the whole family. How many people is in the family? Is there anyone who is sick? Which door to take to leave the house? If there is an earthquake and the house is destroyed where I will find family members.

Do you have an emergency plan for your house?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Yes, I do the same thing for my own house.*

I don't have one myself.

(LaughingJJJ)

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: I really did it. I have a baby that is 1 year old that was the main reason I did it.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: On the question about the 250 gourdes fee, I will dig more into it.

The money is for a badge.

(Pause)

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *That is what I want to find out. The project only last a year we want to integrate these people in a local association. That is why we do our trainings at their locations.*

Besides our GRD there is another GDR that is done by local associations that is bigger. Once I overheard them say in their meetings that they need to stay together.

Sometimes they have a free medical day treating cataracts for the members. They always want to be indentified as Help Age, which is weakness they have. We know that these associations need our help. Help Age is helping them to be autonomous.

5 Manette Noel; Fi; 30 ane; Gesyon administrative; 3 ane ap travay ak Concern : Ok. Now can I speak?

Public: (LaughingJJJ))

5 Manette Noel; Fi; 30 ane; Gesyon administrative; 3 ane ap travay ak Concern :.

I am sorry for being late. I was sick. I didn't go to work today and I had to leave my house at 11 am. My name is Mannette Noel. I work for Concern.

Normil already spoke about the relocation project for Concern. Within the relocation project there is another project called Livelihood. There is a 2,000 gourdes rental subsidy for each beneficiary...

Within that program are the people we called beneficiaries without IDs. They don't have a birth certificate or they lost the papers. We help these people get new IDs. In a family of 5 it can be possible for no one to have paper. Concern will help the whole family get new papers.

Unlike Help Age for the beneficiaries without IDs we have a plan with Unitransfer how to give them money. They have different days to pick up the money, Tuesday and Thursday. There are agents from Concern that will accompany them to pick up the money. The transfer is in the persons own name even if he or she doesn't have an ID.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: We also do that. They have to be able to go and get the money themselves. If the elder is in good health we accompany him to Unitransfer to get the money.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *I will need alot of time to speak*.

Public: LaughingJJJ

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: We refer the people who don't have IDs to IOM. IOM will help them get IDs. We also send people who don't have IDs to Unitransfer but only those who are able. For those who cannot they select a person they trust in the family to collect the money for them.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *Ok. In our case 6 weeks after leaving the camps the beneficiaries get the next installment. How much is it Normil? 6,500 gourdes? It is after that installment we will start the Livelihood project. How do we select the people who will participate in this project? We need to select the most vulnerable. So we need a method to identify them. We do a survey that is called The Most Vulnerable with all Concern beneficiaries. This is where our project is different from the others.*

We do a focus group with the most vulnerable on how they live. We ask them questions on what they eat; how many times they have a meal in the past week. That is how we identify the most vulnerable from the vulnerable. We select the most vulnerable to participate in the project.

We ask questions like,' Charles how many children do you have?' He has 6 children and his wife is dead. 'Did you eat today, Charles?' He said, no I didn't eat today because I didn't have money. Then we might ask Stephanie the same question. She might say something like this, 'I didn't have much but I did eat something this morning'. Those are the type of questions we ask to find the most vulnerable.

After the focus group we will present the project to them. We tell them what they will receive and what rights they have. We let them know it is their right to receive this aid. We will use the information to help them start their business. First we will send them to local markets to find the price on goods. We will go to their communities to identify what they can sell.

We also do a family budget for them. How do we do that? We teach them how do a budget for their families. For the business to succeed they need to be able to have a budget for the family. After the AGR training they get 12,500 gourdes to start the a business. We don't give the whole amount in one installment. We give them 10,000 gourdes for the first installment. We give the

remaining 2,500 gourdes after we do a follow up. This is what Livelihood is, to reinforce the capacity of the beneficiaries.

We also train on nutrition. We showed them that they don't need a lot of money to eat a healthy meal. We taught them that is possible to eat a meal with 25 gourdes. They don't believe at first because according to them even 50 gourdes cannot buy a meal. 25 gourdes will buy a banana and a bread with peanut butter and still have some left over money. We taught how to identify foods that have the aliments the body needs.

We do 4 to 6 visits before they can get the next installment.

We also have professional trainings. We have a contract with KAPAK which is a technical school. OIM also uses that same school. I don't know about the other organisations. Some beneficiaries take cooking class, cosmetology, phone repairing, local arts, and cleaning products.

For the first project each agents has about 30 beneficiaries in their portfolio. During the second project it went to up to 50 beneficiaries for each agent. These agents treated each beneficiary like their own child. Concern is very sensible when it comes to its beneficiaries. The agents will do follow ups individually for each of them to see how they are progressing. Agents don't want to lose a beneficiary that is why the take great care when working with them

Concern also wants to reinforce local products. We encourage the beneficiaries to sell local products. Even though the local products can be more expensive, we help them find markets where they can buy goods at good price.

Local products such as rice, eggs, and soda. We also tried to work in reforestation. We encourage them to buy cookers that don't use much charcoal. We also teach them on marketing so they can sell their goods faster.

Ok. I have some questions for you.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *No problem*.

As for the cleaning products I know it can be difficult to find them in the country, how does Concern help in them in getting materials to make them?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: We have local suppliers in charge of getting supplies. Concern already planned on that. The beneficiaries know where to get supplies and how much it will cost. We do the same thing for those who sell local arts.

Really?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Some of the local crafts they sell are jewelry, office supplies, paintings, household items such as trays. We have suppliers that direct them on where to buy supplies.

Ok. My next is question is how long the project lasts? It seems like the AGR project has several different parts. How long does it last?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Our program in Concern usually lasts 1 year, the relocation project is about to end now. When we move the people from the camps and they receive the last installment the program ends. But Livelihood goes farther than that. The process is longer. The program we have now started in November and will end in June.

As for the technical trainings we do a test that is called Ciko Technique to indentify beneficiaries that qualify for these trainings. Not everyone qualifies because you cannot ask a father of 6 kids without a wife to leave the kids home and go to technical school.

Ok. How long is that? Do they get a certificate?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: 6 months.

6 months for professional school, how long does AGR last?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Its 6 months. They don't have class everyday and class doesn't last a whole day. As agents we are still work with them during their technical trainings. When they don't have class with KAPAK that is when we have traings on nutrition, sanitation, and GRD.

KAPAK is for 6 months and nutrition is also 6 months?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: We have several modules in the program for trainings. The 6 months is for KAPAK.

Does everyone receive trainings on Wash and nutrition?

Public :: Yes, everyone.

Ok. I have another question. Do you think there might be fraud when they select the most vulnerable? Won't people lie when you ask them questions about how many times they eat per day?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: The question about how times they eat is just an example. We do a whole survey to identify the most vulnerable. It is not something that is done over the phone, we do it in person. We do investigations on them. We are very interested on what they have in their houses. The survey has questions to identify the most vulnerable.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Some of the questions are very tricky. If they lie on one question we will see that when they answer more questions farther in survey.*

Ok. Surveys take time to do. We worked with Fonkoze, that survey you're describing t took a long time. How many people participate in the survey? How many people do you have in the most vulnerable program?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: We do the survey with everyone who gets the rental subsidy. In the program we have now, we have about 2,500 beneficiaries. Remember it is not only Concern that is working in the relocation project. We also have IOM, Goal, and Help Age.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *As soon as they move into the house we start with our survey agents. Livelihood will continue the surveys. That is how it is done.*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *To do the survey on the most vulnerable it took us around 3 months.*

What about the vulnerable ones? Do they get aid too?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *No, only the most vulnerable.*

There is a small confusion. When Concern gets to the camps they move everyone out then select the most vulnerable for the program?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *Yes, the most vulnerable.*

Concern only takes the most vulnerable. What about the rest? What do you do with them?

(Everyone tries to talk at the same time.)

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *The survey is for the most vulnerable*.

There is some type of confusion.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *No, no! The reloction project involves everyone in the camp.*

Ok. It is after the relocation that you do the survey.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: After there is a relocation project everyone gets 6,500 gourdes.

Ok.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *The most vulnerable are selected for the Livelihood program. Everyone gets the 6,500 gourdes.*

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *That is why we said earlier that we visit them at home. From 6 to 8 weeks after they move we give the next installment. The agents continue with the survey for the Livelihood project.*

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: If I'm wrong Tim you can correct me. The difference I see between Help Age and Goal from Concern is that they have a relocation project with AGR. Concern has a relocation and Livelihood project. All these projects last for about 1 year. All these projects have different trainings. These are differences I see.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *I am sorry Normil. It is a Relocation program. From the Relocation program we have the Livelihood program. The Livelihood project last longer. What do you need for the Relocation program?*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: What I don't undrestand is where you said the Relocation program ends? If it is the same program, where does one part of the program end while the other part continues.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: You call it the Livelihood program but we call it Relocation program. It has a package with education included. I understand the strategy you used. I like your strategy. It shows the difference between the programs.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Let me give an example. If you are in the program which is RTN, returning home..... Wait please. For 6 to 7 months....

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: Stop there! We pay a rental subsidy for 1 year and half. If after a year we don't find that person still living in the house we rent, that is another issue. Would that person still get the aid?

Public: Yes. During the visit its possible for the person to leave the house.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Let me try to make it clear to you.*

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: Hum hum......

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Example....

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Yes. For example as agents in the Relocation project as soon as the person moves to the house, after 72 hours the next installment is given to them and we start with the 6 to 8 weeks visit. The training has already begun by then. That is part of the program last for 6 to 8 weeks then the Livelihood program starts.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *We continued with the follow ups.*

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Well, that's part of it.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: If I am not mistaken, you said the survey done with the most vulnerable are the people that Concern already relocated. Right? I think you....

(Everyone is talking at the same time.)

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: You asked me a question I need time to answer. Right now Concern already stopped with our Relocation project. The AGR program is still being financed.

(Everyone is talking at the same time.)

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Let me talk! Concern doesn't have the Relocation project anymore. We are very satisfied with our Relocation project. The Relocation project is now the Livelihood project. Now we are working in partnership with Goal and IOM. We are working with people they relocated. We have the Livelihood program with them now.

OK

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Oh, things have changed. Do you give them same thing as before?*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *Yes, it changed. Before it was for 18 months because the relocation program was also included and it was more complicated then. Now the Livelihood project lasts for 9 months only.*

Is Help Age still working in the Relocation project?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Yes.

When will it ends?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *This project we are working now should be the last one. Most of the remaining camps are being named villages.*For example, we are in Acra Village and Mega Acra. These people are asking for the camps to be formalized instand of relocated.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *Formalized into villages, they want to build regular houses in the camps.*

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Formalizing these camps into villages is not part of the AGR package. There is somewhere in the program you can help the beneficiary buying building materials but with some restraint. The NGOs are now being face with UCLPP (Unité de Construction de Logements et de Bâtiments Publics). The problem is also political. This is our last year in the relocation project.

When did you start with the Relocation project?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Since 2011

When did it end?

Public: Last year.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: 2 years, it ended in September of 2015. Now we are working with other NGOs who had the Relocation project.

Ok. Thank you. Some of the beneficiaries said there is another installment of 4,000 gourdes they have not yet received, are they the most vulnerable?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Maybe. We

don't have a rental susbidy during the second year. We did train them on how to manage the

business to make enough money to pay their rental fee.

We know it's getting late and some of you need to leave. My question for you is if you were

in charge of the Relocation project what would you do differently? How would you manage

this project better? What would you keep? What would take eliminate? Some people would

say transform the camps in permanent settlements. Besides Place Boyer I wouldn't have a

problem with that method.

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: I would like to

give a unique answer. During the project some of the beneficiaries suggested we move them to

Morne Cabrit or Zoranje instead of paying the 20.000 gourdes rental fee. To me that is good

idea because it not easy to find a house for 20,000 gourdes.

Some of them wanted to rebuild their old homes because that is where they have families and

friends. I don't want to say here is what I would do not but I don't like the process of sending

people to place where they don't know anyone. That is very hard for them.

Ok. Would you like to add something else? You already told us what is good in from your

project.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: What I

think is very important.....

We know Concern is good.

Public: LaughingJJJ

We know that these people were already vulnerable before thet earthquarke. You can finish

saying what you were saying.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: I am not

working the relocation project anymore. We don't have that project anymore.

#1 Dalin Charles; Male; 38 years; Political Science; 5 years working with GOAL: You can talk

about your experiences.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Some of the

beneficiaries suggested for Concern to give them the money instead of paying for the rent. They still have the land from their old homes. Why not give them the money to try and rebuild their

house instead? After the rent ends they will go back to the same situation.

They spent five years living in a tent in camps now they get a rental subsidy for 1 year. What

about school fees? Next year they will have to pay the rent again. These institutions could have

built homes for them instead. It would have been more durable. They are going back to the

same problem after a year.

I want to ask another question. Do you think most of the people who were in the camps are

from the provinces?

Public: Well, normally.....

Was there a system to identify where they lived right before the earthquarke?

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Yes, we know

that.

What was the percentage of people who moved to the capital after the earthquake and

where living in camps?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: The

percentage is very high. From the date we collected, the majority of them were form Ti Goave.

Jeremy, Gonaives, all over the provinces.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: To indentify the

people who were from the provinces we told them we will facilitate their return back to where

they are form if they want to go back.

Did they return?

Public: Yes, alot of them returned.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Concern will not pay for their transport but will send an agent to where they used to live to look at the house.*Concern sends a transfer via Unistranfer. The house owner will need to collect the money.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *They also get the 6,500 gourdes*.

So if someone returns to their old home in the provinces they still get the 20,000 gourdes?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *No, only the* 20,000 gourdes and the next installment of 2,500 gourdes.

What is the percentage for people who moved back to provinces?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *Not all of them wanted to move back. About 10 to 15 percent actually did move back to the provinces.*

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Yes, 10% to 15%

Do you do follow up on them too?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *No, they only get the 2000 gourdes. How do we know these people won't move back to capital? They have land in hometown. They won't have to pay the rent. They will use the money to start a business. We did favor those who wanted to return back home.*

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *After the* earthquake things got worse for them and they move in the camps. They also benefited from the aid.

I want to thank each one of you for coming here today. If you want to ask a question feels free to ask.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: I want to add something more on the last question you asked about the beneficiaries from the provinces. That question has many levels. My role was an agent in the relocation project. I can answer as an agent but not as the person in charge.

If you have the power to change, what would you change?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: No, no. Remember I don't have the power to participate as a leader. I played the role of a technical agent. I can talk as an agent not as the person who was in charge. The state has big role in how things turned up.

Do you really think the state has something to say on how things turn out? Was the state involving in the decisions making. Don't you think it was the foreign aids who decide how to do things?

Public: LauighingJJJ.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: I think our state is poor when it comes to planning. Seriously I think the foreigners did what they think is best. They let the NGOs do whatever they want. I am asking myself do they really think this is the best thing to do? I am talking! Let me talk! This is my opinon!

We have a social problem. Yes, paying a rental subsidy is helping but at what level? After 2 to 3 years that money is finished. The business will not last long. Why couldn't they use the benefits from the earthquake to do something better? Why couldn't we use land that the state is not using to do something better? These lands are being wasted.

Why couldn't we have built big constructions to help the people? Here is how I would do the project. "Foreigners you want to help me and I know you won't be here a for long time, here is what I need". I am not saying what is being done is not good but it will not last for long. Yes, people benefit from program but for how long.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *The people could have gotten something better than that.*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Yes, the people could have gotten something better than that. It would last longer.*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *That change would have been more visible*.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Where are the things that are done? Do you see them? After 10 years, will there be any more money left? They could have built homes and have the people stay in them for 10 years until they paid them off. They should have done social projects instead.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Listen, you are talking about a global project.*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *I agree with you that is not my place.*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Wait, wait, wait ! As a staff we should be able to discuss the problems. We might not be the directors but we still can speak about changes. What I want to say is what role did the state play in the projects? The state is responsible for the way things turn out.

I understand the question. As an executor you have a plan how you will execute the project. How will you improve the images? How will you get to the people who will benefit from the project?

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: *Do you know how? I mean the director postion.*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: Wait, wait! I am answering the question that was asked. The question said if I was the director what I would do differently. What weakness do I see in the project?

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Keep talking*.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: I am not talking about the Relocation project because we don't have it anymore. I am talking about the Livelihood program because that is where I now work. I am talking about the weakness on that program.

Keep talking.

Public: Laughing JJJ

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: It has its strength and weakness. Let's take the AGR program for example. Although I do follow up with the beneficiaries the business won't last more than 2 months, although we give the money in different installments.

There is one beneficiary who lives in Fontamara she is always calling me to come see how the business is progressing. When I visit her you can see she put the training she got in action but still it's not too much.

Now when you take the ones who took a professional trade there is difference. What they learned is for life. It has a great impact on them in terms of economic support. Right there is where I would make the change.

In a family of 6 or 7 the business will not last long. I prefer the professional trade although there is some weakness. Let's take cooking class for example. The person needs a stove to practice the trade. The people with professional trades need tools to practice their trades. I know tools are not part of the package we have.

If I have the power as a director I would take that into consideration from the beginning in the project. In Concern we see the need but we don't have money for it in the project.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: What I want to say, when you work for an organisation they already have their own structure. I am trying to say if I want to do something different I would need to remove myself from them. I have to be outside to act differently. I don't question their relocation process. I am a relocation agent that's what I do.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *That is why I came in. I am only making propostions.*

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: I understand what you saying but I know I can't over pass my limit. They tell me what to do and that's what I do. But I am a Haitian citizen and I want to talk as a Haitian. What I am saying is that the state should have been involved in the decisions making.

The state should have directed the NGOs on what to do. In 2012 when I was working in Delmas on rental subsidy, it was more than 20000 gourdes. It was anout 51 to 52 thousand gourdes. The state set the rental to 20,000 gourdes as a rental fee and also a small school fee. The state should a project that is more durable even if the NGOs project is short term.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: I really appreciate the invitation. I got the invitation as an agent for Help Age who works in their relocation project so I can only speak as an agent. I am Haitian, if you want to invite me as a Haitian to talk about the problem I will be happy to come.

Public ::(JJJ) I agree with you. We can say the same thing to.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: There is one thing that is very important to me and I already mentioned it. Its true that I work a s a relocation agent for Concern but at the same time if there is a suggestion I should be able to give it. We always do that with Concern. I work in the Livelihood program if there is a suggestion I always bring it to notice.

One lesson we learned was always talk about the weakness and strength of the program. We speak about what we can change to make things better and they applied these things.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: *Yes, that is true.*During the second project we did bring suggestions to make the project better and on the third project the changes were made to the project.

Yes, I learned about what you told us.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *There! That is what we call lesson learned.*

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *To me, why I think we need to talk about these things is if another earthquake happens, If we could do a focus group and sit down to talk about these issues it would be very good for us. We could identify what needs to change. If another earthquake happens we would know what needs to be done.*

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *That is where I am going with my answer. It is not that I am against you...*

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Gason; 31 ane; Sosyoloji; 4 ane ap travay ak Help Age: I didn't say you were against me.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: What is important to me as a Haitian, its true that I benefit from the NGOs because they give me a job.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: *Yes, they give jobs*.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *They gave jobs and helped the people. But what is more important to me is that I understand my follow Haitian needs more than the foreigners*. *It is true I was not involved when the plan for the project was being made, but I work in the project and I know its weakness and strength. I will always suggest the changes that need to be made.*

I don't know if all NGOs are the same but Concern has a general assembly every last Friday of the month where all the employees get together to talk about work. You can always note if a project needs change. Sometimes the change might not be able to me made because the project is already regulated, but what you say can be useful for the nex year.

#2 Jocelito Cherubin; Male; 31 years; Sociologist; 4 years working with Help Age: Allow me to say something. You see what I said is comprehensive. You can approach the question several ways. It can be a technical or social approach. When you have a structure you can have suggestions but that still doesn't change anything. This a global problem.

Let's say there is a problem in education you cannot attack education to fix the problem. You will need to attack people's mentality. You have to change their mentalities to fix the problem. Do you see what I mean?

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: *I* understand where you are coming from. You will have to agree with me if you have a mountain that needs to be removed you won't just turn the mountain upside down to fix the problem.

If you part the system you cannot destroy the system.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: I won't be able to fix the problem at once. But you still can give suggestions.

Too bad we don't have a system for that.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: There! You

as an executor you can bring your own suggestions.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: These are short

term projects. It has a beginning and an end.

Not even the foreigners can change it. Americans are making the plans.

Public: No they cannot change it.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Concern is doing something right now. Concern is giving away goats, a male and a female to people. Concern is even giving them donkeys because the people are in such great need. Concern repairs houses for

them. That is some type of development

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern: These are

devolpment projects. Devolpment projects are long terms project because they last for 2 or 5

years. Emergency devolpment projects don't last more than 2 years.

4 Joel Normil; Male; 34 years; Administration; 6 years working with Concern: Yes, 1 year and

half.

5 Manette Noel; Female; 30 years; Administration; 3 years working with Concern:. That is

problem.

(Hummmmmm)

Thank you everyone for coming.

3 Nikenncia Plaisimond; Female; 31 years; University; 4 years working with Help Age: Thank

you to you too.

END!